

Ronald C. Machen, Esq. MAR 3 0 2009 Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale, and Dorr, LLP 1875 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, D.C. 20066

RE: MUR 6179 (Christopher Ward)

Dear Mr. Machen:

On May 28, 2008, the Federal Election Commission notified your client, Christopher Ward, of a complaint in MUR 6017, and on September 4, 2008, the Commission notified Mr. Ward of a complaint in MUR 6063, each alleging violations of certain sections of the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended ("the Act"). Copies of the complaints were forwarded to Mr. Ward.

Upon further review of the altegatitus contained in the compitients, and other information ascertained by the Commission in the normal course of carrying out its supervisory responsibilities, the Commission, on February 26, 2009, and March 4, 2009, found that there is reason to believe that Mr. Wand knowingly and willfully violated 2 U.S.C. §§ 432(b), (b)(3), (c), (d), (h)(1), and 434(b) of the Act and 11 C.F.R. § 164.14(d) of the Commission's regulations while serving as treasurer of the National Republican Congressional Committee, Tuesday Group PAC, Dedicated to Establishing National Teamwork PAC, Jobs, Economy and Budget Fund, Commitment to Outstanding Leadership and Direction PAC, Prosperity Helps Inspire Liberty PAC, Safeguarding America by Expanding National Security PAC, and Leading US in Success PAC. The Factual and Legal Analysis, which formed a basis for the Commission's Hadings, is attached for your information.

You may submit any factual or legal materials that you believe are relevant to the Commission's consideration of this matter. Please submit such materials to the General Counsel's Office within 15 days of receipt of this letter. Where appropriate, statements should be submitted under oath. In all future correspondence, please reference MUR 6179, into which all of Mr. Ward's matters have been merged. In the absence of additional information, the Commission may find probable cause to believe that a violation has occurred and proceed with conciliation.

Floure note that you have a legal obligation to preserve all documents, records and materials relating to this matter until such time as you are notified that the Commission has closed its file in this matter. See 18 U.S.C. § 1519.

Mr. Ronald C. Machen, Esq. MUR 6179 (Christopher Ward) Page 2

If you are interested in pursuing pre-probable cause conciliation, you should so request in writing. See 11 C.F.R. § 111.18(d). Upon receipt of the request, the Office of the General Counsel will make recommendations to the Commission of their proposing an agreement in settlement of the matter or noncommending electioning that pre-probable counciliation be pursued. The Office of the General Counsel may recommend that pre-probable cause conciliation not be entered into at this time so that it may complete its investigation of the matter. Further, the Commission will not entertain requests for pre-probable cause conciliation after briefs on probable cause have been mailed to the respondent.

Requests for extensions of time will not be routinely granted. Requests must be made in writing at least five days prior to the due date of the response and specific good cause must be demonstrated. In addition, the Office of the General Counsel ordinarily win not give extensions beyond 20 days.

This matter will remain confidential in accordance with 2 U.S.C. §§ 437g(a)(4)(B) and 437g(a)(12)(A) unless you notify the Commission in writing that you wish the matter to be made public.

For your information, we have enclosed a brief description of the Commission's precedures for handling possible violations of the Act. If you have any questions, please contact Michael A. Columbo, the attorney assigned to this matter, at (202) 694-1650.

On behalf of the Commission.

Steven T. Walther

Chairman

Enclosures

Factual and Legal Analysis

FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION

2
2

FACTUAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS

	4	
•	١	þ

RESPONDENT:

Christopher J. Ward

MUR: 6179

I. BACKGROUND

This matter was generated based on information ascertained by the Federal Election
Commission ("the Commission") in the normal course of carrying out its supervisory
responsibilities and based on two separate complaints filed by Prosperity Helps Inspire Liberty
Political Action Committee ("Phil PAC") sad Safeguarding America by Expanding National
Security Political Action Committee ("SAXPAC") segarding the activities of Christopher J.
Ward while serving as treasurer of these committees as well as the following committees: the
National Republican Congressional Committee ("NRCC"); Tuesday Group Political Action
Committee ("Tuesday Group PAC"); Dedicated to Establishing National Teamwork Political
Action Committee ("DENTPAC"); Jobs, Economy and Budget Fund ("JEBFUND");
Commitment to Outstanding Leadership and Direction Political Action Committee
("COLDPAC"); and Leading US in Success Political Action Committee ("LUISPAC"). See 2
U.S.C. §§ 437g(a)(1)-(2). The available information includes indications of apparent
misappropriation of committee funds by Mr. Ward, the committees' former tressurer, as well as
his failure to deposit receipts, and other rectinikeeping and reporting discrepencies that violated
the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended, ("the Act"). Based on the available
information, there is reason to believe that Christopher J. Ward knowingly and willfully violated
2 U.S.C. §§ 432(b), (b)(3), (c), (d), (h)(1), 434(b) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.14(d).

II. <u>FACTUAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS</u>

A. Factual Summaries

1. The National Republican Congressional Committee

The available information indicates that Christopher J. Ward, the NRCC's former treasurer, failed to report or misreported disbursements in connection with his embezzlement of approximately \$725,000 of NRCC funds, in violation of the Act. Christopher Ward worked at the NRCC starting in November 1995, served as the NRCC's long-time comptrollar, was the treasurer of NRCC from 2603 through July 2007, and was a countitant for the NRCC from August 2007 until his termination in January 2008. The NRCC discovered the alleged embezzlement on January 28, 2008 when Ward informed the NRCC that there had been no audit of the NRCC for the year 2006. Ward's consultancy was terminated that same day. The NRCC then discovered that Ward fabricated a draft final audit report and submitted false 2006 financial statements to the NRCC's bank, and had been forging outside audit reports for several years.

During the course of an internal investigation, the NRCC learned that after becoming treasurer in 2003, Ward submitted false audit reports to the NRCC's bank for the years 2002-2006. It appears likely that Ward made several kundred thousant dothers is unauthorized

wire transfers of NRCC friedriction to outside committees whose bank accounts Ward had access to.

including joint fundraising committees. It appears that Ward subsequently made transfers from

those accounts to his personal or business bank accounts. The NRCC also discovered that there

¹ According to news articles, the former head of the NRCC Oversight Committee, Rep. Greg Walden, stated that he had accuping with the outside auditors (Doloitte & Touche, LLP) but that Ward always had a semmingly legitimate reason why the meeting did not happen. Paul Kane, NRCC Says Ex-Treasurer Diverted up to \$1 Million, WASHINGTON POST (March 14, 2008). Rep. Walden stated that the false audit reports were almost perfect forgeries. Id.

are numerous instances in which the unauthorized transfers were not accurately reported, or not reported at all, on the NRCC's disclosure reports.

The available information suggests that the total estimated loss to the NRCC was approximately \$725,000, that evidence of embezzlement and misreporting was found in the earliest records reviewed (2001), and that Deloitte and Touche, LLP never completed an audit of the 2002 fiscal year. Ward allegedly embezzled \$723,866.50 from the NRCC, which is the sum of embezzlement through "apparently manufactured" transfers by Ward from the NRCC to other committees which Ward served as treasurer and his embezzlement through "apparently unauthorized" transfers of funds contributed to joint fundraising committees, a portion of which would otherwise have been disbursed to the NRCC.

2. Tuesday Group PAC

Ward served as treasurer for the Tuesday Group PAC from March 2007 through August 2007, and continued to serve as a compliance consultant until the embezzlement was uncovered. The available information indicates that during a six-week period from October through December 2007, Ward embezzled a total of \$15,000 from Tuesday Group PAC by drawing funds from its bank account in fire form of five cheeks, each for \$3,000, that he made payable to himself. These checks were not authorized by the Tuesday Group PAC and the disbursements were not disclosed on its reports filed with the Commission. The unautizarized transactions and disbursements were uncovered by way of a self-initiated audit conducted following media reports of Ward's apparent embezzlement of NRCC funds. In March 2008, Tuesday Group amended its reports to disclose these disbursements as "misappropriated funds" on its 2007 Monthly Reports for November and December, its 2007 Year-End Report, and 2008 February Monthly Report.

- 1 The amended reports disclosed an increase in disbursements and decrease in cash-on-hand in
- 2 proportion to the \$15,000 misappropriation by Ward.

3. <u>Dedicated to Establishing National Teamwork PAC</u>

The available information indicates that Ward, who served as DENTPAC's treasurer from August 2006 through February 2003, misappropriated \$2,000 of DENTPAC's funds by writing himself a BEINTPAC check dated November 29, 2097. This transaction was not disclosed on DENTPAC's asports filed with the Commission. For reasons unknown, on Fehruary 1, 2008, Ward wrote a \$3,500 check from his personal bank account and deposited it into DENTPAC's bank account. DENTPAC discovered these unauthorized and unreported disbursements and transactions during a self-initiated audit conducted following media reports of Ward's apparent embezzlement of NRCC funds. In March 2008, DENTPAC filed amendments to its 2007 December Monthly, 2007 Year-End, and 2008 February Monthly Reports. The amended reports disclosed DENTPAC's \$2,000 check to Ward as "misappropriated funds," and

also disclosed Ward's \$3,500 check to DENTPAC as "repayment of misappropriated funds."

4. Jobs, Economy and Budget Fund

Ward served as JEBFUND's treasurer from February 2006 through February 2008. The available information indicates that Ward embezzled \$4,000 of JEBFUND's funds by writing an unauthorized JEBFUND check, dated December 26, 2007, to himself. In February 2008, Ward wrote two checks from his personal bank account totaling \$4,208.78 and deposited them into JEBFUND's bank account. In a letter dated February 6, 2008 addressed to JEBFUND's current treasurer, Ward alleges that his refund checks to the JEBFUND were an attempt to correct accounting discrepancies. These unauthorized disbursements and transactions were not disclosed

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- on JEBFUND's reports filed with the Commission. The JEBFUND uncovered the
- 2 embezzlement through a self-initiated audit that it conducted following media reports of Ward's
- 3 apparent embezzlement of NRCC funds. In March 2008, the JEBFUND filed amendments to its
- 4 2008 February Monthly Report, its 2007 Year-End Report, and its 2007 Monthly Reports for
- 5 February through December disclosing the unauthorized disbursement to Ward and his
- 6 reimbursement. The JEBFUND's submission also alleges that a \$5,000 contribution from
- another PAC to EEBFUND that was previously tisuloged in Committation reports preserved by
- 8 Ward was never deposited into JEBFUND's bank account. Rather, Ward deposited the check,
- 9 perhaps inadvertently, into another PAC's bank account.

5. Commitment to Outstanding Leadership and Direction PAC

Ward served as treasurer since COLDPAC's inception in May 2005 through February 2008. The available information indicates that Ward embezzled \$20,000 of COLDPAC's funds by writing a COLDPAC check to himself dated April 2, 2007. This disbursement was not authorized and not disclosed on COLDPAC's reports filed with the Commission (Ward also failed to disclose as a disbursement a \$500 check payable to Political Compliance Services, a company of which Ward was a partner, which was authorized by COLDPAC). The embezzlement wax disacuvaned by COLDPAC through a self-initiated sadds conducted following media reports of Ward's apparent embezzlement of NRCC funds. In April 2008, COLDPAC amended its 2007 Monthly Reports from May through December as well as its 2007 Year-End Report disclosing both the \$20,000 unauthorized disbursement to Ward and the authorized \$500 disbursement to his company. In addition, COLDPAC's amended reports deleted several disbursements which had not been made by COLDPAC.

6. Prosperity Helps Inspire Liberty Political Action Committee

The allegations in the complaint and other information available to the Commission indicate that Ward served as PhilPAC's treasurer since the PAC's inception on March 22, 2002 until his termination on February 2, 2008. Ward's duties included maintaining the books and records of PhilPAC, as well as ensuring compliance with the Act and the Commission's regulations. Ward received \$300 a reenth compensation from PhilPAC in exchange for the performance of his duties, and all payments to Ward for his services as treasurer have been properly disclosed to the Commission.

Upon learning from media reports of the alleged misappropriations with the NRCC and other committees that Ward served, PhilPAC fired Ward effective February 2, 2008 in a letter dated February 4, 2008. Thereafter, the new treasurer conducted an internal audit and discovered that Ward embezzled a total of \$17,000 of PhilPAC's funds. Ward wrote two PhilPAC checks to himself which were not authorized by PhilPAC: a September 28, 2007 check for \$7,000 and an October 29, 2007 check for \$10,000. These checks were not disclosed by Ward in reports filed with the Commission and it appears that Ward's failure to disclose the checks was an attempt to conceal the unauthorized payments.

The complaint further alleges that Ward failed to deposit into its bank accreant a \$1,500 check from Tuesday Group PAC, which Ward disclosed in PhilPAC's 2007 Year-End Report. PhilPAC has no information regarding where the original check may have been deposited (if anywhere). There is insufficient information at this time to determine whether the missing Tuesday Group PAC check was part of Ward's embezzlement scheme. However, Tuesday

MUR 6179 (Christopher J. Ward) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 7 of 13

1 Group has since issued a new check, and it was deposited into PhilPAC's bank account on 2 May 8, 2008.

Due to Ward's misappropriations and misreporting, PhilPAC bounced two checks to a vendor in December 2007 and incurred additional bank fees in the amount of \$60.76. Ward failed to disclose these bank fees in PhilPAC's disclosure reports.

On January 29, 2008, Ward deposited a \$15,000 contribution from Jerry Weller for Congress, which exceeded the Act's limits on contributions to political committees set forth at 2 U.S.C. § 441a(a)(1)(C), ince PhilPAC's associant. On February 8, 2008, four days after Ward was terminated, PhilPAC refunded the entire contribution to Jerry Weller for Congress and subsequently disclosed both the receipt and refund in its reports filed with the Commission. Disclosure reports filed with the Commission reveal that Jerry Weller for Congress had not disclosed the making of the \$15,000 contribution, but did disclose the receipt of PhilPAC's refund of the contribution.

It appears that Ward may have signed the contribution check from Jerry Weller for Congress but it is unclear how Ward would have had access to the Jerry Weller for Congress checkbook. Although Jerry Weller for Congress disclosed disbursements to Ward's company, Political Compliance Services, for the performance of administrative and appliance services in October and November 2007, there is no indication that Ward served as treasurer of Weller for Congress at any time.

7. Safeguarding America by Expanding National Security <u>Political Action Committee</u>

The allegations in the complaint and other information available to the Commission indicate that Ward sarvad as SAXPAC's trassurer since the PAC's inception in February 2005

MUR 6179 (Christopher J. Ward) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 8 of 13

- until SAXPAC was granted a termination on February 12, 2008 (the Commission granted
- 2 SAXPAC's request for termination before it learned of Ward's alleged embezzlement and
- 3 reporting violations). Following termination of its registration as a political committee and upon
- 4 learning from media reports of NRCC's concerns with Ward, SAXPAC began an internal review
- of its records and found discrepancies between its bank activity and information contained in
- 6 reports Ward filed with the Commission. On May 2, 2008, counsel for SAXPAC notified the
- 7 Commission that SAXPAC's internal review revealed that Ward embezzied committee fithds and
- 8 that there were various reporting discrepancies.
- 9 During its internal audit SAXPAC discovered that Ward wrote himself two unauthorized
- 10 \$5,000 checks from its bank account to which he was not entitled. The first check was dated
- August 20, 2007 and the second check was dated August 24, 2007. It appears that Ward
- 12 attempted to conceal his misappropriations by not disclosing these checks as disbursements on
- 13 SAXPAC's reports filed with the Commission.
- In addition to not disclosing the two checks he wrote himself, SAXPAC's internal audit
- 15 revealed several other discrepancies in the reports that Ward filed with the Commission. In
- 16 September 2007, October 2007, and January 2005, Ward filed reports disclosing payments
- 17 totaling \$4,060 to Pointlool Compliance Services, the consulting company where Ward was a
- partner. However, according to RAXPAC, only a single payment of \$500 was made to PCS.
- 19 During this same time period, Ward's reports filed with the Commission disclosed payments
- 20 totaling \$6,000 to McGahn & Associates, while only a single payment of \$3,000 was made to
- 21 this firm by check dated January 25, 2008 and cashed on February 29, 2008.

On February 6, 2008, Ward made a cash deposit of \$2,393.45 into SAXPAC's bank account. According to SAXPAC, this was an unauthorized deposit, it was not disclosed on

SAXPAC's original reports covering this period, and the source of the funds used for this deposit

4 has not been identified.

SAXPAC's internal review revealed other minor reporting discrepancies attributable to Ward. First, SAXPAC's 2008 January Monthly Report discloses \$130.55 in miscellaneous expenditures for which it can find no accompanying withdrawel from its bank account; and, then report emitted a \$1,000 deposit made nn January 9, 2003. Second, there were bank charges of \$12 per month for the months of October, November and December 2007, and a \$35 bounced check bank fee in February 2008, which were not disclosed on SAXPAC's original reports filed with the Commission. Third, SAXPAC's original 2006 June Monthly Report disclosed a \$1,000 contribution from Dannie J. O'Brien. However, it appears that this check was never deposited into SAXPAC's bank account and it has no records in its possession indicating that O'Brien ever made a contribution to SAXPAC. Last, Ward disclosed a closing balance of \$0.00 on SAXPAC's Termination Report filed on January 27, 2008, when in fact, SAXPAC had a \$600 cash-on-hand balance.

8. Leaving US in Sucress Political Action Committee

Ward served as LUISPAC's treasurer from LUISPAC's inception in February 2004, until he was replaced on February 20, 2008. On June 2Q, 2008, LUISPAC filed five amended reports for the 2007-2008 election cycle disclosing four disbursements to Ward totaling \$40,000, a \$1,000 disbursement to SAXPAC, and a \$23,500 receipt from Ward. Specifically, the amended reports identified as "unauthorized disbursements" a \$20,000 disbursement to Ward on April 9,

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- 2007; a \$10,000 disbursement to Ward on July 24, 2007; a \$5,000 disbursement to Ward on
- 2 August 17, 2007; and a \$5,000 disbursement to Ward on August 24, 2007. The Amended 2008
- 3 February Monthly Report disclosed an "unauthorized political contribution" in the amount of
- 4 \$1,000 on January 3, 2008 to SAXPAC. The available information indicates that Ward wrote the
- 5 checks that disbursed funds to himself without authorization. Further, the Amended 2008 March
- 6 Monthly Report disclosed a \$23,500 receipt from Ward on February 8, 2908 with the purpose
- 7 identified as "refund unsuthosized disbursament."

B. Linuility of Christopher J. Wand

According to Commission policy, a former treasurer may be named as a respondent in his personal capacity when it appears that, while serving as a treasurer, he may have violated obligations imposed by the Act or Commission regulations personally on a treasurer and where, among other situations, the violations were knowing and willful. See Statement of Policy Regarding Treasurers Subject to Enforcement Proceedings. 70 Fed. Reg. 3 (January 3, 2005); see, e.g., MUR 5610 (Earl Allen Haywood) and MUR 5721 (Kenneth Phelps). A knowing and willful violation may be established "by proof that the defendant acted deliberately and with knewledge" that an action was unlawful. Unlawd States v. Hopkins, 916 F.2ti 207, 214 (5th Cir. 1990). In Hopkins, the quort found that an inference of a knowing and willful violation cauld be drawn "from the defendants' elaborate scheme for disguising their . . . political contributions . . ."

Id. at 214–15. The court also found that the evidence did not have to show that a defendant "had specific knowledge of the regulations" or "conclusively demonstrate" a defendant's "state of mind." if there were "facts and circumstances from which the jury reasonably could infer that

- 1 [the defendant] knew her conduct was unauthorized and illegal." Id. at 213 (quoting United
- 2 States v. Bordelon, 871 F.2d 491, 494 (5th Cir.), cert. denied, 493 U.S. 838 (1989)).
- Ward appears to have transferred hundreds of thousands of dollars from the committees
- 4 he served as treasurer to himself over the course of at least six to seven years. The available
- 5 information suggests that Ward attempted to disguise his embezzlements by knowingly and
- 6 willfully emitting the unauthorized transactions from the reports he filed with the Commission
- 7 on behalf of tim committees its served, by amitting them from the internal meterial resords of the National
- 8 Republican Congressional Committee, and on at least two occasions by intentionally
- 9 mischaracterizing disbursements to vendors on reports he file with the Commission. The
- 10 Commission can infer that he had knowledge his conduct was prohibited by law based on his
- attempts to conceal it. Consequently, the Commission has made findings, discussed below, as to
- 12 Christopher Ward in his personal capacity for his actions while serving as treasurer of the NRCC.
- 13 Tuesday Group PAC, DENTPAC, JEBFUND, COLDPAC, PhilPAC, SAXPAC, and LUISPAC.
- As treasurer of the NRCC, Tuesday Group PAC, DENTPAC, JEBFUND, COLDPAC,
- 15 PhilPAC, SAXPAC, and LUISPAC, Ward was required to accurately keep an account of and
- disclose cash-on-hand, receipts and disbursements. See 2 U.S.C. §§ 432(c), (d) and 434(b)(1),
- 17 (2), (3), (4), (5) and (6)(A) and (B) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(a), (b). Further, he was required to
- deposit all committee recaipts in designated bank accounts. 2 U.S.C. § 432(h)(1) and 11 C.F.R.
- 19 § 103.3(a). Committee treasurers required to file any report or statement under the Act and the
- 20 Commission's regulations are also personally responsible for the timely and complete filing of
- 21 the report or statement and for the accuracy of any information or statement contained in it. 11
- 22 C.F.R. § 104.14(d). It appears Ward knowingly and willfully failed to keep an accurate account

- of all cash-on-hand, disbursements and receipts, and failed to deposit receipts, in connection with
- 2 his activities as treasurer of the NRCC, DENTPAC, JEBFUND, COLDPAC, PhilPAC,
- 3 SAXPAC, and LUISPAC in order to hide his fraudulent scheme and failed to accurately disclose
- 4 certain receipts and disbursements in the reports that he filed with the Commission.
- The Act also prohibits the commingling of committee funds with the "personal funds of
- any individual," including officers of a committee. 2 U.S.C. § 432(b)(3) and 11 C.F.R. § 102.15.
- 7 The Commission has previously made findings that individuals have violated 2 U.S.C.
- 8 § 432(b)(3) in matters where the individuals misappropriated amunitate funds by ranking
- 9 unauthorized disbursements to themselves or others to pay for personal expenses. See, e.g.,
- MUR 5610 (Earl Allen Haywood), MUR 5721 (Kenneth Phelps), MUR 5811 (Kristi Willis) and
- MUR 5872 (Jennifer Hildebrand). But see, e.g., MUR 5898 (Ryan Pennington).
- In connection with his work as treasurer for the NRCC and its joint fundraising
- 13 committees, Christopher Ward appears to have knowingly and willfully commingled committee
- 14 funds with his personal funds by wiring NRCC's funds without authorization to the bank
- 15 accounts of other committees that he served as treasurer and then subsequently transferring those
- 16 funds to his own bank accounts. Based upon available information regarding the other
- 17 committees. Ward also knowingly and willfully committed committee funds with personal
- 18 funds by writing himself checks from committee accounts without authorization. It appears that
- 19 Ward either cashed the checks or deposited them into his personal bank account. For example,
- 20 as treasurer of SAXPAC, Ward endorsed the back of checks that he wrote to himself and wrote
- 21 an account number below his signature corresponding to one of his personal bank account
- 22 numbers. In addition, on at least three occasions, Ward deposited his personal funds into

MUR 6179 (Christopher J. Ward) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 13 of 13

- committee accounts by writing checks from his personal bank account and depositing them into
- 2 committee accounts. As another example, given that the Commission does not know the source
- 3 of funds used to make Ward's unauthorized deposit of \$23,500 into LUISPAC's account,
- 4 questions remain as to whether Ward took funds embezzled from another committee, placed
- 5 them in his personal bank account, and then deposited them into LUISPAC's bank account.
- Therefore, there is reason to believe that Christopher Ward knowingly and willfully
- 7 violated 2 U.S.C. §§ 432(b), 432(b)(3), (c), (d), (h)(1), and 434(b), and 11 C.F.R. § 104.14(d) in
- 8 this matter.